

Comparing Multiple Accounts of the Same Event

Name: _____

Date: _____

Score: _____ / 10



Quick Review

When two writers tell about the SAME event, ask: Who is each writer? What do they pay attention to? What do they FEEL about the event? Notice the SAME facts they share AND the DIFFERENT details each one chooses to include.

PART 1 — READ

Read the passage. Then answer the questions.

The Tagging of Whale 27: Two Accounts

PASSAGE 1: News Article — "Researchers Tag a Humpback off the Maine Coast" (Portland Daily Press, June 12). A team of marine biologists from the Atlantic Whale Project successfully attached a tracking tag to a young humpback whale on Tuesday morning, about twelve miles east of Portland Harbor. The whale, identified by its black-and-white tail markings as Whale 27, was first spotted by a research vessel at 8:14 a.m. The crew approached carefully and used a long pole to place a small electronic tag on the whale's back. The tag will record the animal's location for the next year. "This data will help us understand where Whale 27 feeds and travels," said Dr. Lila Park, head of the project. The tagging took less than two minutes, and the whale showed no signs of distress.

PASSAGE 2: Letter — Dr. Lila Park, Field Notebook, June 12. Today was a long one. We left harbor at 5 a.m. in cold fog and chop, and I was sure we'd see nothing. Then at 8:14 a.m. there she was — Whale 27, the same young female we tagged unsuccessfully two summers ago. My hands were shaking when I lifted the pole, partly from the cold and partly from how much this tag matters. We have been waiting three years for a chance to follow this exact whale. When the tag clicked into place I could hardly breathe. Then she lifted her tail in that black-and-white salute and dove. The whole boat cheered. I am writing this from my bunk, still smelling like salt water and engine fuel, and I am grinning.

PART 2 — PRACTICE

Read both accounts. Then choose the best answer for each question.

1. What type of text is PASSAGE 1?
 - A. A personal letter to a friend
 - B. A news article reporting on the event
 - C. A scientific report with charts and data
 - D. A children's story



2. What type of text is PASSAGE 2?
 - A. A field-notebook entry by the scientist who took part in the tagging
 - B. An interview transcript
 - C. A textbook chapter about whales
 - D. An advertisement for a whale-watching trip
3. Which fact appears in BOTH accounts?
 - A. The boat left harbor at 5 a.m.
 - B. The whole crew cheered after the tag was placed.
 - C. Dr. Park's hands were shaking.
 - D. Whale 27 was spotted at 8:14 a.m.
4. Which detail appears ONLY in passage 2?
 - A. Whale 27 was a humpback.
 - B. The team had tried to tag this same whale two summers ago and failed.
 - C. The boat was twelve miles east of Portland Harbor.
 - D. The whale's tail had black-and-white markings.
5. How is the POINT OF VIEW of passage 1 different from passage 2?
 - A. Passage 1 is told from outside the event in third person; passage 2 is told from inside the event in first person.
 - B. Passage 1 is told from the whale's view; passage 2 is told from a passenger's view.
 - C. Both passages are told in the first person.
 - D. Both passages are told in the third person.
6. Which sentence BEST describes how the TONE of the two accounts differs?
 - A. Both accounts sound emotional.
 - B. Passage 1 sounds angry; passage 2 sounds bored.
 - C. Passage 1 sounds calm and factual; passage 2 sounds personal and emotional.
 - D. Both accounts sound calm and factual.
7. Why might Dr. Park's notebook include details that the news article does NOT?
 - A. The newspaper writer did not know what "humpback" meant.
 - B. Dr. Park did not understand what really happened.
 - C. Dr. Park was AT the event and writing for herself, while the newspaper writer was reporting facts for the public.
 - D. Newspapers are always longer than field notebooks.



8. Which sentence from PASSAGE 1 is closest in meaning to passage 2's line, "When the tag clicked into place I could hardly breathe"?

- A. "The whale was first spotted by a research vessel at 8:14 a.m."
- B. "The team of marine biologists from the Atlantic Whale Project successfully attached a tracking tag to a young humpback whale on Tuesday morning."
- C. "The data will help us understand where Whale 27 feeds and travels."
- D. "The tag will record the animal's location for the next year."

9. Pick ONE detail that appears in passage 2 but NOT in passage 1. Why might that detail have been left OUT of the news article?

10. Reading BOTH accounts gives the reader something neither one ALONE would give. What is that?

- A. A second time and place for the tagging
- B. Proof that one account is wrong
- C. The full picture: the public facts AND the personal experience of the person doing the work
- D. A description of the whale's family



Answer Keys

<p>1 <input type="radio"/> A <input checked="" type="radio"/> B <input type="radio"/> C <input type="radio"/> D</p> <p>2 <input checked="" type="radio"/> A <input type="radio"/> B <input type="radio"/> C <input type="radio"/> D</p> <p>3 <input type="radio"/> A <input type="radio"/> B <input type="radio"/> C <input checked="" type="radio"/> D</p> <p>4 <input type="radio"/> A <input checked="" type="radio"/> B <input type="radio"/> C <input type="radio"/> D</p> <p>5 <input checked="" type="radio"/> A <input type="radio"/> B <input type="radio"/> C <input type="radio"/> D</p>	<p>6 <input type="radio"/> A <input type="radio"/> B <input checked="" type="radio"/> C <input type="radio"/> D</p> <p>7 <input type="radio"/> A <input type="radio"/> B <input checked="" type="radio"/> C <input type="radio"/> D</p> <p>8 <input type="radio"/> A <input checked="" type="radio"/> B <input type="radio"/> C <input type="radio"/> D</p> <p>9 <input type="text" value="See below"/></p> <p>10 <input type="radio"/> A <input type="radio"/> B <input checked="" type="radio"/> C <input type="radio"/> D</p>
---	--

Explanations	
1. B	Passage 1 has a newspaper byline and reports facts in third person — a news article. A would be addressed to a person; that fits passage 2 better. C would have charts; this passage has none. D is fictional storytelling, which this is not.
2. A	Passage 2 is a first-person diary-style entry by Dr. Park — exactly a field notebook. B would have Q-and-A. C would be neutral and explanatory. D would be selling a service.
3. D	Both passages name 8:14 a.m. as the spotting time. A, B, and C appear ONLY in the personal field notebook (passage 2).
4. B	The history of an earlier failed tagging only appears in Dr. Park's notebook. A, C, and D all appear in the news article in passage 1.
5. A	Passage 1 uses "the team... the crew... Dr. Park said," while passage 2 uses "I... we... my hands." B invents a whale narrator. C and D each erase the obvious difference.
6. C	Passage 1 just reports facts; passage 2 includes shaking hands, hardly breathing, cheering, grinning. B invents emotions not present. A and D ignore the clear tone difference.
7. C	Personal details belong in private notes; public news sticks to facts. A is wrong — the article uses "humpback" correctly. B contradicts the text — Dr. Park led the project. D is the opposite of what is shown here.
8. B	Both sentences describe the same MOMENT of attachment — but one is calm and factual, the other emotional. A names the spotting, not the tagging. C and D describe what the tag will DO afterward, not the moment of attachment.
9.	Answer: Sample answers: (1) The detail "my hands were shaking" is left out because a news article reports facts, not the writer's feelings. (2) The detail "we tagged unsuccessfully two summers ago" is left out because the public usually doesn't need the team's history to understand today's news. (3) The detail "I am still grinning from my bunk" is too personal for a news article. NOT acceptable: details that actually appear in passage 1, or reasons that say the news writer did not know the fact (Dr. Park IS quoted in the article). Strong answers (1) pick a detail that really is unique to passage 2 AND (2) explain that personal/emotional/back-story details fit a notebook but not a public news article. Reject answers that misidentify the detail.
10. C	Together, the two accounts pair public facts with private experience. A is wrong (only one event happened). B is wrong (the accounts agree). D is wrong (no family info appears anywhere).

